

## **Deliberation Procedures: Student Handout #3**

You have been assembled to discuss the U.S. Department of Education's "gainful employment" rule proposal. You will meet with individuals who represent different points of view to deliberate on the proposal and recommend whether the rule should be enacted. Use the following procedure to guide your efforts.

The group's goal is to answer this question: ***Is the gainful employment rule the best way to help college graduates pay back their student loans?***

### **1. Opening Statements**

Each stakeholder group will make an opening statement, developed from information in the "Gainful Employment Rule" essay. Your statement should incorporate information from the stakeholders' guide and answer the questions: *What group do I represent? What do I think of the gainful employment rule? As the other members describe their position, take notes on the "Stakeholders' Points of View" chart.*

### **2. Statement of Premises**

Think about each person's opening statement. What are the common assumptions your group has with any of the others? In other words, what things do all or most of the stakeholders agree on? As a group, list them at the top of the **Deliberation Records** chart. One assumption is already listed on the chart to get you started.

### **3. Identifying Options**

On the **Costs and Benefits** chart, as a group, make a list of recommendations for the gainful employment rule based on what each stakeholder feels about the rule. These recommendations can range from "kill it" or "keep it as is" or change some element of the proposal explaining what it would be and why.

### **4. Evaluating Options**

Go through each recommendation and discuss what are the costs and benefits of each. List these costs and benefits on the chart.

### **5. Deciding on the Best Option**

As a group, study the chart and ask yourselves: "Which recommendations have the most benefits? Which have the fewest costs?" Circle those recommendations. Is one recommendation clearly superior to the others? If not, have each group member state which recommendation he or she favors and why. Does one recommendation appear to be the best one now?

### **6. Completing the Agreement Form**

On your own, complete the **Agreement Form**.